

# CHAPTER

## 12

## CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

**12.1** From the detailed presentations given in the preceding chapters of this Annual Report, it is more than apparent that the National Commission for Minorities worked with vigour and sincerity during the reported year to ensure that the constitutional and legal rights of the notified minority communities are effectively preserved and protected. It succeeded in a large measure to implement its mandate as a watchdog for the implementation and protection of the minorities' constitutionally guaranteed legal rights.

**12.2** Although the recommendations of the Commission have already been highlighted at appropriate places in the previous chapters, it would be worthwhile to recapitulate in brief the major recommendations made by it during the reported year.

**i) Visit of the National Commission for Minorities to Haryana**

**Visit to village Tikri Brahman, Palwal (on 9<sup>th</sup> July, 2015)**

- ❖ Adequate compensation to be paid to the riot victims at the earliest.
- ❖ All efforts be made to provide adequate protection to the victims and others who were feeling highly insecure.
- ❖ Strict action to be taken against the culprits by quick investigation of FIRs by the SIT.
- ❖ Meeting of elders from both the communities (i.e. The Peace Committee) should be held without any further delay to calm down the tempers and remove the trust deficit.
- ❖ Insurance companies may be contacted and advised to quickly settle the insurance claims in respect of damaged vehicles.
- ❖ Intelligence gathering activities of the police must be intensified to sniff out impending troubles before they erupt out into actual violence.

**Visit to Mewat (on 16<sup>th</sup> April, 2015)**

- ❖ The request of the Mewat Engineering College (Waqf) for a Non-Recurring Grant of Rs. 6 crore and recurring grant of Rs. 4 crore were forwarded to the Ministry of Minority Affairs for favourable consideration.
- ❖ The Ministry of Minority Affairs was requested to consider increasing the limit of educational loans provided to minority community students who are pursuing professional post graduate courses.
- ❖ The Haryana Government was asked to set up a mechanism to monitor the proper use of funds granted for infrastructural development in the Mewat district to ensure that buildings meant for Primary Health Centres, Anganwadi Centres and Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas are completed in time.
- ❖ The Haryana Government was asked to ensure that School Management Committees (SMCs) consist of people with integrity and good reputation to ensure proper utilization of funds meant for development of schools.
- ❖ The Haryana Government was advised to appoint and retain qualified teachers from the Mewat region itself to prevent attrition of teachers.
- ❖ The Haryana Government was asked to assign the work of supervising constructions, mid-day meals etc. in schools to designated persons who are not teachers. This will enable the teachers to focus on teaching.

**Visit to Rohtak (on 1<sup>st</sup> May, 2015)**

- ❖ The Commission wrote to the Haryana Government to direct the District Administration to prepare a detailed action taken report regarding a Christian graveyard after conducting a survey of the graveyard land and also holding meetings with the leaders of the All Saints Church at Rohtak.

**Visit to Atali Village, District Faridabad, Haryana (on 27<sup>th</sup> May, 2015)**

- ❖ The appalling conditions of the victims were highlighted and the administration was advised to make adequate arrangements for the victims to be housed and fed with immediate effect.
- ❖ Immediate action was recommended to arrest and punish the culprits.



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ Individual FIRs were advised to be filed immediately, instead of the joint FIR that the residents were coerced into filing.
- ❖ The damage to properties was advised to be adequately assessed and compensation be accordingly calculated.
- ❖ All efforts be made to protect the properties of the Muslim residents of the village till they are able to return to the village.
- ❖ All efforts were advised to be made to provide adequate protection to the victims for them to feel safe and to return to their homes.

### ii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Uttar Pradesh

#### Visit to Agra (on 27<sup>th</sup> April, 2015)

- ❖ All measures were recommended to be taken to reassure the local Christian community of police and administrative support and to provide security to churches until a sense of confidence among the community was restored.
- ❖ The district authorities were advised to carry out the investigation in the incident with urgency and to bring the perpetrator (s) to book.

#### Visit to Muzaffarnagar and Shamli (on 18<sup>th</sup> September, 2015)

##### For State Government:

- ❖ That the resettlement colonies be provided with civic amenities and other facilities like child care and general health care for the inhabitants.
- ❖ That Anganwadis be made accessible to children in the colonies, and ASHA workers be deputed to these neighbourhoods.
- ❖ That efforts be made to expedite the registration of voter identity for the inhabitants of these new colonies.
- ❖ That formalities for issuing Shramik cards and MNREGA job cards to all who are eligible should be expedited.
- ❖ That the State Government and the local administration should take steps to persuade and convince the banks to give loans, for which many of the residents had already been identified. This would go a long way in resolving the issue of livelihoods for the displaced.



- ❖ The issue of those missing in the violence and whose bodies had not been identified was still not resolved and the condition for a seven year waiting period still stands before compensation could be given to the families. This was causing the families enormous hardships with no support. Therefore, the earlier recommendation made by the NCM team to use the precedent of the Uttarakhand tragedy where the State Govt. declared all missing as dead and allowed compensation, was re-iterated.

For the Ministry of Minority Affairs (MOMA):

- ❖ To consider the proposal for funds submitted by the Minority Welfare Officers of the two districts and funds to be released expeditiously.

**Visit to Village Bisahda, near Dadri, Distt. Gautam Budha Nagar (on 15<sup>th</sup> October, 2015)**

- ❖ It would be quite an under - statement to say that Bisahda killing was merely an accident, as was being claimed even by some persons in authority. The facts as reported to NCM team point strongly that the whole episode was the result of a planning, in which a sacred place like a temple was used for exhorting people of one community to attack a hapless family. Moral policing with impunity was being resorted to at many places. The malaise is spreading fast, especially in Western Uttar Pradesh. What is more disturbing is that responsible persons converge at the place of any such incident and make irresponsible statements, which further vitiates the relations between the communities. This has to be stopped at all costs; otherwise things will go out of hand. It seems that intelligence gathering is no more occurring in the rule book of the authorities. It has to be revived with utmost sincerity if we are really interested in restoring communal amity. It is an issue on which both the central and state authorities are to work in tandem without blaming each other.
- ❖ Without waiting for such incidents to happen again at other places, sensitization of people of various communities through inter-faith dialogue is required to be put in place by activating peace committees. Although it is something which has to come from the civil society, the state machinery needs to get involved in such an initiative.
- ❖ The families of deceased Mohd. Akhlaque and his three brothers had already shifted out of Bisahda because of fear and trauma. Although the people of majority community are now assuring that they will ensure their safety, the victims are not convinced. There are media reports that



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

the State government was contemplating to provide a house each to the four affected families somewhere in Noida. The gravity of the situation has already been gauged by the State authorities by providing enhanced monetary compensation. Providing dwelling units to the four affected families will, therefore, further prove their resolve to help the victims lead a life without fear.

- ❖ Social media were being extensively used to flare up communal passions. Some form of vigilance and curb on such hateful attempts is the need of the hour.
- ❖ Police investigations regarding the incident need to be completed expeditiously so that the culprits are brought to book and dealt as per law. The long arm of the law must prevail.
- ❖ All the political establishments need to counsel their cadres and sympathisers to desist from making irresponsible statements and making capital out of such outrages.
- ❖ The State Government of U.P. should advise the concerned authorities to respond quickly to this Commission as and when a report regarding such happenings is sought from them.

### iii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Uttarakhand

#### Visit to Dehradun (from 27<sup>th</sup> Dec. 2015 to 1<sup>st</sup> January, 2016)

- ❖ The demand for construction of a Gurudwara Gyangodri near Har ki Pauri at Haridwar by the Sikh community may be considered.
- ❖ The inclusion of Bhoti language in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Constitution may be considered.
- ❖ The demand of scholarship for Buddhist students studying in various monastic schools at Dehradun from the Central or State Government, may be considered.

### iv) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Jharkhand

#### Visit to Ranchi (from 6<sup>th</sup> to 8<sup>th</sup> May, 2015)

##### For Government of India

- ❖ The quota fixed for Sikh pilgrims from the State of Jharkhand to visit Nankana Sahib in Pakistan may be increased to at least 100. The visa processing for these pilgrims may be simplified.





### For Government of Jharkhand

- ❖ The Teachers Aptitude Test (TAT) may also be conducted in Punjabi (Gurumukhi script) and Pali languages.
- ❖ Members to the Jharkhand State Minorities Commission may be nominated from all notified religious minorities in the State.
- ❖ The Members of the Jharkhand State Minorities Commission may be given salaries and adequate travel allowance.
- ❖ The scholarships and all schemes available to the minorities under the Prime Minister's New 15 Point Programme may be widely publicized and implemented efficiently.
- ❖ The Jharkhand State Minorities Development and Finance Corporation, Jharkhand Waqf Board and Jharkhand Waqf Tribunal may be made fully functional.
- ❖ A Haj Committee, Urdu Academy and Madarasa Board may be established.

### Visit to Ranchi (from 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> August, 2015)

- ❖ The report of two-member team comprising Divisional Commissioner and DIG of Police who enquired into the alleged incidents of communal violence has been submitted to the State Government. It would be appropriate for the State Government to take immediate necessary action based on the recommendations contained in the report.
- ❖ Adequate compensation may be given to the victims of the communal violence as per the norms in this regard.
- ❖ Peace committees may be set up and regular meetings may be held.
- ❖ The government grants may be released to enable the implementation of the following activities covered under the Prime Minister's New 15 Point Programme:-
  - (i) Upgradation of skills through technical training.
  - (ii) Enhanced credit support for economic activities.
  - (iii) Equitable share in rural housing scheme (Indira Awas Yojana).
  - (iv) Improvement in conditions of slums inhabited by minority communities.



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ The State Government/ District Administration may streamline the implementation of pre-matric and post-matric scholarship schemes.

### v) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Himachal Pradesh

**Visit to Kinnaur, Lahaul Spiti and Kullu (from 3<sup>rd</sup> to 13<sup>th</sup> May, 2015)**

#### **Ministry of Home Affairs.**

- ❖ Inclusion of Bhoti Language in the 8<sup>th</sup> Schedule of the Constitution

#### **Himachal Pradesh Government.**

- ❖ Grant of scholarship to students of all the registered societies managed by the monasteries and nunneries under Prime Minister's 15 Point Programme for the welfare of the minorities.
- ❖ Early allotment of land for graveyard for Christians of Manali and providing sufficient land for graveyard to the Christians of Kullu.
- ❖ Appointment/deputation of two Buddhist teachers to Mahila Mandal Rangrik to teach Bhoti Language to the women of Rangrik village for 4 months from November to February so that the women could utilize the winter months for learning Bhoti Language.

#### **Ministry of Culture.**

- ❖ Financial aid for the construction of Sarai Bhawan for the Buddhist pilgrimages of Kullu and Lahaul Spiti District by the Ministry of Culture.
- ❖ Reduction in the applicant institution share from 33% to 10% for undertaking any project in Himachal Pradesh, as practised in the Sikkim and Arunachal Pradesh.

### vi) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Kerala

**Visit to Cochin, Calicut and Kasargod (from 15<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> February, 2016)**

#### **For the Directorate of Minority Welfare, Government of Kerala:**

- ❖ Need to publicize programmes and schemes, so that these schemes can be accessed by communities in far flung areas.
- ❖ To more effectively disseminate information about Coaching Centres for Public Service Commission exams.
- ❖ More coaching sub-centres and training centres for skill development to be established through the various schemes.



- ❖ Need for more active minority cells within the administration of these districts.
- ❖ Need for the State Minorities Commission to be more active in these areas.
- ❖ The minority cell to look into the issue of granting equivalence for examinations in Madrasas.

#### **Ministry of Minority Affairs (MoMA)**

- ❖ Although the Ministry has put in place a system where classification for Multi-sectoral Development Programme (MsDP) is done on the basis of blocks, in Kerala there are only 4 blocks in Wayanad and one town - Mallapuram, that qualify. The State wants its own criteria to be considered so that state can avail of funds. Need to consider the State's proposal for minority blocks.

#### **Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD)**

- ❖ Release of funds for Scheme to Provide Quality Education in Madrasas (SPQEM) and Scheme for Infrastructure Development in Minority Institutions (IDMI), both of which seem to be having problems, where funds are either not reaching or have been stopped all together without adequate explanation or notice.

#### **vii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Arunachal Pradesh**

##### **West Kameng (Bomdila) and Tawang districts (from 5<sup>th</sup> to 12<sup>th</sup> October, 2015)**

#### **Ministry of Minority Affairs**

- ❖ Release of pending payments of the projects undertaken by Deputy Commissioners, Bomdila and Tawang under MsDP.
- ❖ Enhancement of funds for the construction of Anganwadi Centres from Rs. 3 lakhs to Rs. 10 lakhs in view of cost escalation of building material and its transportation charges.

#### **Arunachal Pradesh Government**

- ❖ Funds released by MoMA for some projects under MsDP to the State Government have not been provided further to the districts. The State Government may release the funds to the Deputy Commissioner to complete the projects in time.





## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ Regarding Rs.400 provided for two sets of uniforms for school children, State Government/Ministry of Tribal Affairs to consider enhancement of the amount in view of increased cost of uniform in far-flung areas of the state.
- ❖ State Government to consider the opening of ITI at Tawang to impart necessary vocational training to the needy persons of the district.

### Ministry of Culture

- ❖ A large number of heritage monasteries are there in Mon region of Arunachal Pradesh, but financial constraint has led to neglect of these cultural treasures and needs immediate attention for their preservation.

### viii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Goa

(from 7<sup>th</sup> to 13<sup>th</sup> July, 2015)

- ❖ The local MLA was advised to follow up the issue with the PWD Minister and start the development of the Muslim graveyard plot soon after the rainy season

### ix) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Nagaland

(from 9<sup>th</sup> to 13<sup>th</sup> April, 2015)

- ❖ To pay compensation to the family of the lynching victim, Farid Khan.

### x) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Manipur

(from 9<sup>th</sup> to 13<sup>th</sup> April, 2015)

- ❖ State to apply for Central Govt funds for Modernisation of Madrasas.
- ❖ District Administration to be empowered to select the right blocks having substantial minority population for MsDP.
- ❖ Creation of a Minority University at Lilong.
- ❖ Creation of a separate Minority Department in place of existing Dept. for Minority and OBC Welfare.
- ❖ Appointment of Chairman, State Minorities Commission which was lying vacant since March, 2014.



**xi) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Meghalaya  
(from 28<sup>th</sup> May to 1<sup>st</sup> June, 2015)**

**For Central Government**

- ❖ In States where a religious notified minority is in majority, whether the PM's 15 Point Programme should be applicable to all minorities or to minorities other than the one in majority in the particular State.
- ❖ Sanction and release of funds as per the request of the Deputy Commissioner, West Garo Hills.

**For State Government**

- ❖ State Govt. to issue Aadhar cards to all citizens within a specific time frame.
- ❖ Steps be taken to create awareness regarding schemes under MsDP in West Garo Hills and PM's 15 Point Programme in all the districts, like press publicity and holding awareness camps under respective DCs.
- ❖ Land be provided for Masjid in Jowai.
- ❖ Provide an ITI and Girl's hostel in Phulbari and Mahendraganj blocks of West Garo Hills.

**Visit to Meghalaya (from 15<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> October, 2015)**

- ❖ The State Govt. of Meghalaya may create a State Minorities Commission.
- ❖ The State Govt. to take necessary steps to enable Madarsas to get financial assistance from SPQEM. State Govt. may also release bridge funding to the Madarsas in West Garo Hills and take action to provide Mid-day meals to the minority run institutions.
- ❖ Compensation to be paid to people for damage to their property during the floods which had affected the Garo Hills and many parts of Assam in September, 2014.
- ❖ Construction of ring wells and tube wells, especially in the Hills.



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ Some of the villages are connected by wooden /rope bridges and need to be replaced by culverts.
- ❖ Proper utilization of Central Govt. schemes for Pre-Matric and Post-Matric scholarships.
- ❖ More teachers posts need to be sanctioned under the Sarv Shiksha Abhiyan
- ❖ More houses need to be sanctioned under Indira Awas Yojana.
- ❖ To look into the complaint that there are no jobs available for Muslim youth and in many areas they are even deprived of voting rights.

### **Visit to Meghalaya (from 30<sup>th</sup> March to 3<sup>rd</sup> April, 2016)**

- ❖ CM, Meghalaya to consider allotment of land for a mosque in Jowar Headquarters of West Jaintia Hills.
- ❖ DC, East Khasi Hills to consider allotment of land to construct a school.
- ❖ MoMA may launch a publicity campaign in the North-East regarding scholarship schemes.

### **xii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Tripura (from 15<sup>th</sup> to 19<sup>th</sup> October, 2015)**

- ❖ State Minorities Commission to be set up in Tripura.
- ❖ The State Govt. to take up the public demand for the construction of Minority Girl's hostel in Agartala with MoMA.

### **xiii) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Mizoram**

**(from 30<sup>th</sup> March to 3<sup>rd</sup> April, 2016)**

- ❖ MoMA may launch a publicity campaign in the North-East regarding scholarship schemes.

### **xiv) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Rajasthan**

**(from 16<sup>th</sup> to 20<sup>th</sup> July, 2015 )**

- ❖ Rajasthan Govt. to consider hike in salary of Madrasa teachers.



- ❖ Rajasthan Government should look into lower representation of minorities in ICDS and take steps to increase the number. The number of minority beneficiaries for education loans and business loans also needs to go up.
- ❖ DC, Ajmer to look into the matter of filling up of vacant posts of Urdu teachers on priority basis.
- ❖ State level review of PM's 15 Point Programme and MsDP must be held atleast twice a year after quarterly reports have been received from the districts. This will make the system more accountable.

#### **Visit to Barmer and Jaisalmer (from 7<sup>th</sup> to 10<sup>th</sup> January, 2016)**

- ❖ The State Govt to provide alternative land to the evicted families in village and tehsil Chauhtan (Barmer).
- ❖ The State Govt. should post more Urdu teachers in Barmer and Jaisalmer.
- ❖ The State Govt. may consider the following:-
  - Proposal for opening of new residential schools for minorities needs to be approved.
  - At present there is only one ITI in General Category. There needs to be atleast one or two more in minority dominated areas.
  - More girl schools need to be opened to encourage girl education.
  - There is tremendous difference between the salary of madarasas school teachers and other teachers. The variation is to the tune of minimum Rs. 20,000 per month. This needs to be narrowed down to the extent possible.
- ❖ Follow up action may be taken by the State Govt. for piped water connection and hostel building as requested by Al-Suffah Educational & Charitable Trust in Pokhran.
- ❖ MoMA to set up Girl's hostel in Jaisalmer as per the request of Madrasa Islamiya Darul-Uloom in Pokhran
- ❖ The SP Jaisalmer to submit the report on the rape incident.



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ The Rajasthan State Minority Department should put up a proposal for increasing the strength by double of the minority Girl's hostel.
- ❖ The DM of both Jaisalmer and Barmer should regularly monitor the implementation of Prime Minister's 15 Point Programme and MsDP.

### Visit to Alwar (on 14<sup>th</sup> March, 2016)

- ❖ Funds for MsDP may be released by MoMA as requested by DM, Alwar.
- ❖ DM to send the DMWO and District Programme Officer to MoMA to update them regarding MsDP and PM's 15 Point Programme.
- ❖ DM to pay attention to problem of non-availability of forms in schools for applying to pre-matric scholarships and denial of minority certificates to Buddhist community.
- ❖ State Government should nominate a Buddhist Member in the State Minority Commission.
- ❖ State Government to look into the following issues :
  - Illegal mining is taking place in the Mewat region and there is tremendous water scarcity.
  - There are no facilities for teaching Science, English and Maths in rural schools. As there are no facilities available for education in these subjects a number of students have no option but to go for arts and crafts.
  - There is great paucity of Urdu teachers.
  - No facilities are available for teaching Punjabi in schools despite the fact that there were over 50,000 Sikhs in the district.
  - Despite approval of the Mewat Development Board, no Girl's Hostel has started.
  - Nearly 25% of girls drop out after class 8 due to lack of facilities like school buses/ public transport.
  - Like an existing Dev Narayan Yojana, girls from minority community should be provided with scooties.

### xv) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Bihar

#### Visit to Kishanganj and Purnea (from 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> Feb., 2016)

- ❖ The DMs of both the Districts Kishanganj and Purnea should update figures of pre-matric, post-matric and merit-cum-means scholarships.





- ❖ The Chief Secretary of Bihar should direct the DMs of Kishanganj and Purnea to put in greater efforts for implementation of PM's 15 Point Programme and MsDP.
- ❖ Both the districts are having a high population of minorities. It is advisable that action is initiated by the State Minority Welfare Dept. to construct a Girl's hostel for minority students, especially in Kishanganj.
- ❖ The State Government should work out a methodology for better publicity of Central Govt Schemes for Minorities especially PM's 15 Point Programme, MsDP and schemes of Maulana Azad Education Foundation.
- ❖ MoMA may organize a special training camp on minority welfare schemes for senior officials of districts in Bihar.

**xvi) Visit of National Commission for Minorities to Punjab**

**Visit to Bathinda, Mansa and Ludhiana (from 20<sup>th</sup> to 22<sup>nd</sup> July, 2015)**

**Government of Punjab**

- ❖ The State Government may direct all District Authorities to allot separate and sufficient land to the Muslim and Christian minority communities for use as graveyards.
- ❖ The State Government may direct all District Authorities to allot sufficient and separate land to the Muslim and Christian Minority Communities for the construction of their own community halls to enable them to peacefully conduct their social and religious functions.
- ❖ The State Government may direct the Bathinda District Administration to order the closure or relocation of liquor shops that are located in close proximity to the Girls Senior Secondary School, Bathinda.
- ❖ The State Government may issue an appropriate notification to recognize Christians who belong to the OBCs to enable the authorities to issue them OBC certificates.
- ❖ The State Government may constitute a full-fledged Waqf Board so that waqf lands which had been encroached upon by the government itself and other private parties may be restored and brought under the management of the Waqf Board.



## NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR MINORITIES

- ❖ The State Government may instruct every District Administration to widely publicize and implement all the schemes under the PM's New 15 Point Programme benefiting minorities and also designate officers specifically for the purpose of monitoring their implementation.
- ❖ The State Government may constitute a separate Directorate for Minorities to oversee the implementation of all minority related schemes.
- ❖ The State Government may consider avoiding holding of competitive exams and other public events on important festivals of notified religious minority communities.

**12.3** The above recommendations clearly reflect the deep resolve of the National Commission for Minorities to spare no efforts in resolving the problems of the notified minority communities, especially their socio-economic and educational empowerment, as also their safety concerns and other perceived handicaps. It is now for the concerned authorities to take remedial action in respect of these recommendations. In terms of section 13 of the NCM Act, 1992, a duty has been cast on the Central Government to lay the Annual Report of the Commission before each House of Parliament, together with a memorandum of action taken on the recommendations contained therein, in so far as they relate to the Central Government, and the reasons for the non-acceptance, if any, of any of such recommendations.